

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN

## MINUTES

**CASE CAPTION:** Agee, Jr., et al v. Benson, et al

**Case Number:** 1:22-cv-272

**Date:** November 3, 2023

**Time:** 8:41 a.m. – 10:24 a.m.  
10:40 a.m. – 12:18 p.m.  
1:20 p.m. – 2:56 p.m.  
3:06 p.m. – 3:59 p.m.

**Place:** Kalamazoo

**Three-Judge Panel:** Paul L. Maloney, Raymond M. Kethledge, and Janet T. Neff

### APPEARANCES

Plaintiffs: John J. Bursch, Michael J. Pattwell, Jennifer K. Green, Amia Banks, and James J. Fleming

Defendant Benson: Erik A. Grill

Defendants Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission and the individual commissioners: Katherine McKnight, Dima Atiya, E. Mark Braden, Patrick T. Lewis, and Nathan Fink

### PROCEEDINGS

Nature of Hearing: Bench Trial – Day 3; Commission Defendant's presentation of evidence

### WITNESSES

Commission Defendants: Anthony Eid, Bruce Adelson

### EXHIBITS

Description	Admitted
Plaintiffs' Exhibits 36, 64, 65, 71, 72	No motion
Commission Defendants' Exhibits TX 1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 15, 17, 18, 19, 21, 50, 51, 52	No motion

Court Reporter: Genevieve Hamlin

Case Manager: Amy Redmond